

June 5-6, 1989

NOTE FOR THE RECORD

Subject: Visit of ODA Monitoring Mission to Chitral

The Mission comprised the following:

- | | | |
|---|------------------|---------------|
| - | Dr. Sean Conlin | Leader |
| - | Mr. Eric Gill | Economist |
| - | Mr. Peter Scopes | Educationist |
| - | Dr. Tim Lusty | Health Expert |

AK NETWORK BRIEFING

SSK, Mubarak Shah and Steve Rasmaussen gave an overall briefing of their respective programmes with special reference to ODA assistance in the district of Chitral.

The Mission members enquired about the top-down planning approach in the school mapping exercise and the impracticality of the VO linkage in the field-based teachers training programme. They were of the opinion that FBTT programme should be separated from the present assistance and packages which lend themselves to VO linkage, should be included. On the health side, they were satisfied with the VO linkage which has become stronger with the formation of the clusters, as Steve pointed out, a very useful forum was emerging for health activities. There was some discussion on the remuneration being paid to community health workers (CHWs) by the villagers. On the composition of the professional staff for health services. Steve informed that of the 100 professionals and 100 support staff, 50 % of the LHVs were local, 18 LHVs were being sent from the area for training every year for a 2-year course. Next year, the number of seats has been increased to 22. He hoped that in years to come, the staff would be fully localised.

AK NETWORK DINNER

Nearly 100 guests turned up representing all departments and section of societies in Chitral. This afforded an opportunity to all members of the Mission to meet and discuss issues of their interest with the relevant officials of the departments.

AKRSP BRIEFING

FS gave a break-down of the coverage by AKRSP as follows:

- | | | | |
|---|-----------------|---|---------------|
| - | 42% Ismaili Vos | - | 27% Sunni VOs |
| - | 28% Mixed VOs | - | 3% Kalash VOs |

The detailed data in terms of progress of different package was provided.

Dr. Sean Conlin (SC) and Mr. Eric Gill (EG) who attended the AKRSP briefing, observed that the questions asked last year by the Monitoring Mission, have been answered. They enquired reasons for the slow PPIs and steps taken in case a PPI is abandoned. They also wanted to know the reasons for short-fall in training of specialists and marketing courses. They also wanted to know about the progress made in developing the production model, suggested by the World Bank. In respect of monitoring and evaluation, they enquired about the role being played by MER in providing monitoring and management information to SOs and MG.

On consultancy, they expressed satisfaction over the utilization of the training courses but expressed concern on non-utilization of technical cooperation consultancies.

FIELD TRIPS

At Buni, SC expressed pleasure at the wise and sensible decisions being made by the cluster and sought clarification about the functions of the working committee, set up by the cluster, namely whether the committee had authority to intervene in VO affairs and was its role only recommendatory. The cluster activist explained that all VOs were represented on the working committee, hence its recommendation was binding on the VO. EG looked at the accounts book kept by the VOs and felt satisfied on the accounting system and maintenance of books at VO level.

The team also met members of 3 women organizations at Buni and had a discussion with them.

At Harchin Lasht, the team members enquired about the objectives of the cluster and how decisions of the cluster were implemented specially in social matters, as the cluster had decided to stop wasteful expenditure on marriages and other ceremonies. He was informed that the cluster would impose fines if its decisions, reached by consensus of all the VO representatives, were flouted. The team members also enquired about education and health needs of the cluster VOs. They also discussed the future plans of the cluster and the VOs. EG looked at the books maintained at the VO level. The villagers requested help in recommissioning two of the micro hydel units installed in the area in pre-AKRSP period by the Appropriate Technology Division of the Government of Pakistan. FS promised to look into the matter.

At Zang Lasht (a Sunni valley), more than 250 members greeted the team. SC thanked the VOs for the enthusiastic welcome. He enquired if there were any problems in completion of the PPIs and sought reasons for construction of so many roads as PPIs. He also enquired about the possibility of introducing a development package for women. The VO representatives assured the team of their unconditional collaboration with AKRSP and said that there were no problems with the PPIs and the isolation of the valley necessitated construction of link roads as PPIs. They welcomed women's package and informed that 5 women have already been trained in poultry keeping. They also requested for help in girls education. They also enquired that if ODA could provide directly interest-free loans.

At Droneel (DC Chitral also accompanied us on this trip), SC complimented the VO on their comprehensive explanation of what was going on in the VO and enquired if other VOs were jealous because Droneel was doing so well and had obtained so many loans for so many things from AKRSP. The other VO representatives stated that they were not at all jealous and were actively striving to come up to the level so that they could also obtain similar facilities from AKRSP as Droneel has done.

A discussion took place on remuneration of the CHWs and a view was expressed that there was an impression that CHWs get a commission on medicines they sell, which is enough by way of compensation. However, they realized that a reasonable remuneration for CHWs would be necessary if the programme is to be sustained. A plea was also made for provision of family planning facilities at the health centres. Similarly education facilities were also demanded.

The women's group which Emma Hooper attended at Droneel, complemented what the VO discussed with the team.

At Bashkeet (Gram Chashma), SC enquired about the advantages of the link roads. He also wanted to know if VO were agreed to a crop change from cereals to potato, apricot and apples. The members narrated the advantages accrued to them due to the construction of link road and asked for marketing facilities before switching crops, as their potatoes did not sell last year and they had to incur losses. On a query as to why credit was not being taken by women, SC was informed that loans will be obtained for nursery development and patti weaving.

At Sheli Lasht (pre-dominantly Sunni valley), SC enquired about the problems in implementation of the PPIs and their plans after completion of PPIs. The VOs informed that there were no problems in implementation of the PPIs except in case of Mori Paeen where due to recurrent damage by sliding, the cost has exceeded the original estimates. As to future planning, they mentioned about their plans for marketing, vegetable cultivation, land development etc. On savings, they informed SC that 20% of the wage was being put in savings by members. On women's programme, they informed that poultry training saved 900 chicks during the season. They preferred a women's section under the umbrella of the VO and requested for a girls middle school, which the DC promised to provide.

On the common orchard at Sheli Lasht, established with ODA assistance, the members informed that although the land was owned by only 8 households, 2 non-owners also worked on the orchard in rotation every month. The produce of the orchard would be shared 50:50 between owners and non-owners.

At Madak Lasht, the 4 VOs described their progress and SC thanked them for their reports.

At Kalash Bamborate, 3 valley representatives and Wazir Kalash Women's Organization gave an account of their progress. SC thanked for the welcome and written information. On his query as to how income will be increased by increasing savings, the WO informed that on increased savings, loans would be obtained to grow vegetables and for breeding animals to have more income from the sale of vegetables and wool.

WRAP-UP SESSION WITH AKRSP

SC observed that the coverage of different activities was smooth and according to expectations. The philosophy that VO was the linchpin for ODA involvement for health and education activities, was valid and ODA would continue to support VO as the central point for ODA assisted programmes.

EG referred to the increase in the administrative costs to the tune of Rs. 4 million (expected by the end of the current grant period) and enquired the reasons for it. He also mentioned the expected financial short-fall in completion of the targeted 210 PPIs to the tune of Rs. 15 million. Similarly he pointed out to the likely over-run of the credit allocation of Rs. 13 million.

After discussion and explanation of the three areas of concern, the Mission agreed to recommend that the short-fall in funds be met by the increase of funds due to the exchange rate. However, they requested assurances that the administrative cost and the PPI cost would not be allowed to exceed the estimated amount namely Rs. 4 million on administrative and Rs. 15 million on PPIs at the average rate of Rs.270,000 per PPI.

On detailed discussion of packages, SC observed that the PPIs were going smoothly and the slow PPIs were not a cause of undue concern, however a case by case investigation should be carried out and not too rigid a policy in terms cost estimates would be followed. In case of justifiable increase, estimates should be revised. He suggested extension time of completion of PPIs to March 1991, thus giving time to an Appraisal and Monitoring Mission due in June 1990 to look at a 7-year old package.

SC was informed that extension of time for PPIs was not needed because it would be possible to initiate 210 PPIs under ODA grant by June 1990.

On other packages, SC observed that these were also going smoothly as in previous years. On women's programme, he referred to Dr. Emma Hooper's consultancy and hoped that she would come up with an agenda dimension encompassing programme needs. On credit, he was interested how the revolving funds would progress and on savings he wanted incentives for keeping up the good performance and also wanted to know the reasons for motivating people to save differentially. He asked MER to carry out studies to find out distribution of benefits within the VO. He observed cluster to be a good development which seems to be slowly moving towards the apex idea, so essential to sustainability.

EG briefly commented on the report of the consultants on setting up of the investment organization. He suggested that the economics of the investment organization should be looked at carefully and recommended full computerization to save overhead costs. In his view future projection (Rs. 2 billion savings in 15 years) defy credibility. He offered specialists help if AKRSP would send him the TOR.

On technical collaboration, SC offered to provide assistance if TORs were sent on different fields such as social organisation, agro-forestry/orchard, financial specialists, marketing, MER, rapid rural appraisal, credit motivational progress etc. On training in UK, of the 63 man-months, AKRSP has utilised or committed to utilise 45 man-months and requested for an additional 15. There are 45 man-months for technical cooperation and the short-fall in training in UK, may be made up by shifting funds from technical cooperation. On the question of improvement of proficiency in English language of DPO staff Chitral, it was suggested that Matthew Adamson may be requested to visit Chitral to make an assessment of needs in this field.

SC proposed that the period of current grant be extended till April 1991 and a new 7-year phase be developed which should be appraised and approved by ODA and Government of Pakistan between June 1990 and April 1991. The proposal should be ready by mid-May 1990 and the broad parameters of the project should include: emphasis on cluster activities, health and education packages which lend themselves to VO linkage such as adult literacy package, cluster schools for girls, expansion of health module, specially in Sunni area; water and sanitation package; family planning development of financial institutions; institute of rural development; English language teaching; technical cooperation and training in UK and interface with government departments.

In regard to monitoring and appraisal visit, SC suggested that to reduce the burden on monitoring, he would suggest visits by professional consultants whose reports may be used by the Appraisal Team. In addition prior to arrival of the Appraisal Team, an assistant may spend a month to go into details thus enabling a small appraisal team of 2 members comprising a social scientist and an economist to undertake the final exercise.

AK NETWORK WRAP-UP

In the network wrap-up which was attended by the full ODA team as well as AKRSP, AKHS and AKES representatives, issues pertaining to maintenance of land rovers, supply of spare parts, replacement of accidented land rover for AKRSP, were discussed besides the technical cooperation and training in UK.

SC also briefed network about his meeting with the Sunni group (mostly district council members) and their concerns about extension of health and education programme to non-Ismaili areas and the setting up of the AKRSP project-boards in VOs. On the project board issue, it was clarified that any VO not wishing to have a board installed, may do so in case ODA was not unduly concerned that its contribution was not being acknowledged. SC observed that ODA would have no such concern. SC urged on the network members, to have discussion and contact with the Sunni groups so as to remove many of the mis-conceptions they have about staffing etc.

DEBRIEFING AT ISLAMABAD

The ODA team had a debriefing with RS at Holiday Inn on arrival in Islamabad.